

Revised October 14, 2022

July 18, 2022

Via Email

City of Clifton
Zoning Board of Adjustment
900 Clifton Avenue
Clifton, NJ 07013

Re: **Engineering Review No. 2**
Applicant: 522 Valley Estates LLC
522 Valley Road
Block 32.01, Lot 12
City of Clifton, Passaic County, New Jersey
NEA No.: CLIFSPL22.021

Honorable Board Members:

As requested, Neglia Group ("Neglia") has performed a review of the materials received on June 6, 2022, in support of the above-referenced application. Specifically, Neglia has reviewed the following:

- City of Clifton Planning Board & Zoning Board of Adjustment, Application for Planning Board or Board of Adjustment Application for Development or Appeal, dated March 30, 2022;
- Traffic & Parking Assessment Report prepared by Matthew J. Seckler, P.E., P.P., P.T.O.E. and John R. Corak, PE of Stonefield Engineering & Design, LLC, dated January 19, 2022;
- Architectural Site Plan Set consisting of five (5) sheets entitled, "Proposed Townhouse (21 Units) Development" At: 522 Valley Road, Clifton, New Jersey" prepared by Osvaldo Martinez of OMLK Architects LLC, dated March 2, 2022;
- Signed Engineering Site Plan Set entitled consisting of six (6) sheets, prepared by Steven L. Koestner, PE of Koestner Associates, dated March 4, 2022, **last revised October 4, 2022;**
- **Drainage Calculations prepared by Steven L. Koestner, P.E., L.S. of Koestner Associates, dated July 6, 2022;**
- **Existing and Proposed Conditions Drainage Maps prepared by Steven L. Koestner, P.E., L.S. of Koestner Associates, dated July 6, 2022;**
- **Signed Comment Response Letter, prepared by Raymond Moraski and Steven L. Koestner, P.E., L.S. of Koestner Associates, dated October 5, 2022;**
- **Signed Soil Erosion and Sediment Control Plan, prepared by Steven L. Koestner, PE of Koestner Associates, dated October 4, 2022;**
- **Signed Sanitary and Water Flow Calculations Report, prepared for 522 Valley Road, Tax Lot 12, Block 32.01, City of Clifton, Passaic County, New Jersey, prepared by Steven L. Koestner, PE of Koestner Associates, dated October 4, 2022;**

- **Environmental Impact Statement Report**, prepared for 522 Valley Road, Tax Lot 12, Block 32.01, City of Clifton, Passaic County, New Jersey, prepared by Steven L. Koestner, PE of Koestner Associates, dated October 7, 2022;
- **Geotechnical Investigation and Slope Stability Analysis Report**, prepared by Kyle J. Kopacz, P.E. and Laurence W. Keller, P.E. of Whitestone Associates, Inc., dated August 22, 2022;
- **Unsigned Turning Template Analysis Plans** consisting of six (6) sheets entitled, Garden State Realty & Investments, Proposed Townhouses, Block 32.01, Lot 12, 522 Valley Road, City of Clifton, Passaic County, New Jersey, prepared by John Corak, P.E. of Stonefield Engineering & Design, dated October 4, 2022;
- **Lighting Analysis Plans** entitled “Lighting Layout, Version 2”, prepared by Damin Sales, dated October 5, 2022; and
- **Review Letter** prepared by Traffic Division Commander Lieutenant Mohammad Droubi of the City of Clifton Police Traffic Division, dated October 7, 2022.

Property Information

The property in question is located within an irregular-shaped lot that consists of approximately 167,555 square feet (3.85 acres), located on Block 32.01, Lot 12, commonly known as 522 Valley Road, Clifton, New Jersey. The property is located on the western side of Valley Road (County Road 621), north of the intersection with Mt. Washington Drive. The property in question is situated within the R-A1 (Residential, One-Family) Zone and the Steep Slope Overlay District. The site is bordered by residential developments to the north and south, Valley Road (C.R. Route 621) to the east with residential uses beyond, and a densely vegetated area to the west.

The subject property is currently developed with a two and one-half (2½) story residential dwelling with concrete walkways, an asphalt driveway, and a storage shed in the rear yard. The property’s current use is one-family residential and the proposed use will be a new 21-unit townhouse complex development. Additional proposed features include an asphalt access drive, concrete sidewalks and curbs, paver driveways, landscaping, lighting, stormwater management measures, utilities and retaining walls.



Aerial Image of the Property

1. Variances/Waivers

- 1.1 We defer all comments regarding use, zoning, variances, setbacks, height, design waivers, and sufficiency of the parking supply to the Board's Planning Consultant.

2. General Engineering Comments

- 2.1 The Applicant's professionals shall provide testimony supporting all requested/required variances and waivers.
- 2.2 At such time as a hearing is scheduled regarding this matter, a representative or owner of the project site shall be present to provide testimony detailing any proposed site improvements and address questions from the Board.
- 2.3 The Applicant project fronts the Valley Road Right-of-Way (County Road 621), which shall be to the satisfaction of the Passaic County representatives, in addition to the Board Engineer and City Representatives. A note stating the same shall be provided on the site plan. Copies of all correspondence with the County and any revisions requested by the County shall be supplied to the City and this office.
- 2.4 The Applicant shall be responsible for the expenses related to any reconstruction of pavement, curb, sidewalk, or other public property damaged during construction activities. Notation indicating the same shall be including on the plans.

A note has been added to the plans. This comment has been addressed.

- 2.5 The Applicant shall submit a set of proposed plans to the City of Clifton Fire Department and Police Departments for review, comment and approval. This submission shall include a vehicle-maneuvering plan indicating the proposed vehicle maneuvering for all site operations, such as refuse collection and movements of emergency fire apparatus, on-site access, and circulation. The Applicant shall obtain and address any comments from the City of Clifton Fire and Police Departments.

The Applicant has submitted a vehicle-maneuvering plan and shall revise the plans to include the proper fire turning apparatus as per the City of Clifton Fire Department Review. In addition, the Applicant shall revise the plans to address the comments noted the Clifton Police Department Traffic Division review letter.

- 2.6 The Applicant is required to meet existing pavement and curbing at several points around the perimeter of the property and General Note #20 states that all curb and sidewalk along the property frontage shall be replaced to the satisfaction of the board engineer. The Applicant shall replace any damaged, cracked, or settled curb, sidewalk, and driveway aprons, if any, along Valley Road to the satisfaction of the Board Engineer, City representatives, and Passaic County representatives as well. This note shall be revised to state the same. Copies of all correspondence with the County and any revisions requested by the County shall be supplied to the City and this office.

A note has been added to the plans. This comment has been addressed.

- 2.7 The Applicant shall provide testimony confirming that all ADA accessible routes, points of ingress/egress, parking spaces, etc. will conform to the current ADA Standards for Accessible Design provided by the Department of Justice, latest revised. In addition, the applicant shall ensure that flush curbs are proposed and called out at all curb ramps on the Site Plans, with associated spot elevations indicating compliance with ADA standards.

-
- 2.8 The Applicant shall include an ADA parking space in each of the two (2) visitor parking areas.
This comment has been addressed.
- 2.9 The Applicant shall provide testimony addressing vehicular circulation for deliveries, loading/unloading, trash/recycling, and other operational issues as may be deemed relevant to the application.
- 2.10 The Applicant shall ensure that the operations of soil movement vehicles are not to be utilized in a way that would deposit soil on any street, sidewalk, or within any other private property. Additionally, if any soil or sediment is deposited as indicated above, the Contractor shall be responsible to immediately rectify the situation. A notation indicating the same shall be provided on the plan.
A note has been added to the plans. This comment has been addressed.
- 2.11 The Applicant shall protect any perimeter fencing, curbs, plantings, and walls on adjacent properties during construction. The Applicant shall be responsible for any damage to neighboring properties during installation of proposed improvements. A note on the plan stating the same shall be provided.
A note has been added to the plans. This comment has been addressed.
- 2.12 The Applicant shall provide testimony confirming that no covenants or deed restrictions exist on this property. In addition, notation stating the same shall be provided on the survey, if granted approval.
- 2.13 Neglia recommends that the Applicant provide color renderings of the proposed building façade improvements for presentation to the Board.
- 2.14 The new depressed curb and concrete driveway aprons proposed along Valley Road shall be constructed with a sidewalk through the apron at a minimum of 4' wide and maximum 2.0% cross slope. Notes shall be added to the plans for clarity.
A note has been added to the plans. This comment has been addressed.
- 2.15 The Applicant shall provide testimony for all proposed signage including, but not limited to size, height, illumination, etc.
- 2.16 The Applicant shall include the radii of all proposed curbs on the site plan.
- 2.17 The Applicant shall provide any and all applicable Passaic County details including but not limited to driveway apron, pavement section, etc.
This comment has been addressed.
- 2.18 Line of sight/sight distance at the proposed access driveway shall be shown on the site plan to ensure adequate sight distance with the new driveways.
This comment has been addressed.
- 2.19 The Applicant shall provide testimony indicating compliance with the requirements set forth in the Steep Slope District Clifton Zoning Code §461-24.1.
- 2.20 In accordance with City of Clifton Zoning Code §461-24.1D, sites located within the steep slope district shall submit the following:
-

- a) *A soils engineering report regarding site characteristics of the subject property to include the nature, distribution and suitability of subsurface soils for load-bearing, stability and compaction, extent, description and location of exposed rock, erodibility potential of surface soils; permeability and available water-infiltration capacity; depth to bedrock and seasonal highwater table; and the location, type and intensity of vegetative cover on the subject property.*
- b) *A geophysical-hydrologic report investigating conditions of the site's underlying geologic formation and the hydrological characteristics of the proposed development shall be submitted. It must demonstrate that any adverse impacts can be overcome in such a manner as to prevent hazard to life and property and to maintain amenable site features for stormwater management, soil erosion and sedimentation control, vegetative cover and exposed rock stability.*
- c) *Site grading and development data shall be submitted and shall include the type and location of development activity; procedures for grading, excavation, construction access, stockpiling; extent and phasing of construction; and cut and fill operations.*
- d) *A land forms analysis prepared by a geologist or a licensed professional engineer shall be submitted showing the location and extent of the site's major landforms including the top of cliff, base of cliff, the cliff face, talus slope and the side slope. The landform analyses shall calculate the area in each landform category.*

The Applicant has provided a supporting geotechnical report. The site engineer shall incorporate the findings from this report into the grading and stormwater design for the site to address the review comments noted in section 5 of this report.

- 2.21 The open space area calculation indicates a 1,750 square-foot area denoted with dimensions 35'x50', whereas the area appears irregular in shape and shall be revised to include the exact area of open space in order to demonstrate compliance with City of Clifton Zoning Code §461-24.1H. In addition, the open space area in the northeastern portion of the site also appears irregular in shape. The Applicant shall provide testimony with regards to the Open Space requirements.

The Applicant has relocated the site open space area to the rear of the property. The required open space is 16,800 square-feet and the Applicant proposes 17,140 square-feet. This comment has been addressed.

- 2.22 The Applicant proposes a tiered retaining wall system, where wall heights vary in height along the perimeter of the proposed development. Upon completion of construction, and if granted approval, all retaining walls in excess of four feet in height, including buried depth, will require signed and sealed certification by a licensed professional engineer in the State of New Jersey confirming that the wall was built in accordance with the plans and details and that it will support its design and intended loads. Neglia recommends that the Applicant prepare a separate retaining wall plan denoting each retaining wall with an identifying number or letter listed on an associated table with average height calculations of each wall.
- 2.23 The Applicant shall provide testimony with regards to the need for parapet walls, guiderails, or fall protection fencing along the proposed retaining walls.
- 2.24 The Applicant shall provide typical retaining wall details indicating the type of walls proposed.

This comment has been addressed.

3. Traffic and Parking Comments

3.1 The Applicant shall provide testimony addressing vehicular circulation for deliveries, trash/recycling procedures, circulation, fire apparatus, security measures, and other operational issues as may be deemed relevant to the application

3.2 The Applicant has provided vehicle turning maneuvers on the submitted site plans. While the vehicle depicted is shown to have no issues maneuvering, the Applicant shall label the size of this vehicle to confirm that it is an AASHTO standard design vehicle. The vehicle turning maneuvers shall address the largest anticipated truck, emergency, and waste disposal vehicles expected to access the site.

The plans shall be revised in accordance with the City of Clifton Fire and Police Department Reviews.

3.3 The Applicant shall obtain comments from the City of Clifton Fire and Police Departments regarding emergency site access, safety, or other concerns.

3.4 The Applicant shall comment on whether or not the proposed site driveway will be gated.

The Applicant has indicated that the entrance will not be gated. This comment has been addressed.

3.5 The Applicant shall provide sight distance triangles at the proposed driveway along Valley Road.

This comment has been addressed.

3.6 As per the New Jersey Administrative Code, Section §5:21-4.14 (RSIS), the parking requirements are as follows:

- a) 2.4 spaces per 3-Bedroom Townhouse: 21 3-Bedroom Units are reported.
- b) A one-car garage and driveway combination shall count as 2.0 off-street parking spaces, provided the driveway measures a minimum of 18 feet in length between the face of the garage door and the right-of-way.
- c) Based on the above parking rates, the parking requirement for the proposed Townhouse development is 50 spaces total. Each townhouse would feature a garage and driveway combination. The Applicant proposes an additional 11 visitor spaces bringing the total proposed parking to 53 spaces.

3.7 The EV Parking Requirements are as follows:

- a) NJ S3223 P.L. 2021 c.171: Prepare as Make-Ready parking spaces at least 15 percent of the required off-street parking spaces, and install EVSE in at least one-third of the 15 percent of Make-Ready parking spaces; 8 EVSE spaces are required.
- b) The Applicant does not show any EVSE or Make-Ready parking spaces on the submitted site plans. The Applicant shall provide testimony addressing this.

The Applicant shall revise the plans to illustrate the locations of the proposed EV Parking Spaces, including proposed EV striping and charging station locations, with a means of electric service depicted on the plans. Details shall be added to the plans for the same.

3.8 Neglia has reviewed the Traffic & Parking Assessment Report, dated January 19, 2022, and we noted the following:

- a) The Trip Generation provided uses the 11th Edition of the ITE Trip Generation Manual to source the trips shown. We take no issue with the results shown.

- b) The Applicant uses the parking demand rates cited from the ITE Parking Generation Manual 5th Edition to support the proposed parking supply. We take no issue with the results shown.

4. Utilities Comments

4.1 The Applicant proposes to construct a new sanitary sewer line which serves more than two buildings, and the increase in sanitary flow will require a Treatment Works Approval (TWA) from the NJDEP. Sanitary sewer capacity calculations illustrating adequate capacity within the existing sanitary sewer subsystem into which the site is tributary to accommodate the daily average and peak sanitary sewerage flow that the project will generate shall be provided at the time of TWA submittal to the City. The Applicant shall provide a sanitary sewer study, including continuous flow monitoring data for a minimum of a thirty (30) day period, inclusive of wet weather conditions at one (1) point downstream of the proposed facility to be included as part of the TWA submittal for review.

4.2 The Applicant shall provide projected sanitary flow and water demand calculations for review. The said calculations shall be submitted to the City of Clifton Department of Public Works to confirm adequate capacity within the existing system. If confirmation cannot be acquired, a thirty-day sewer meter study shall be performed, and results submitted to our office for review.

The Applicant has provided projected sanitary flow calculations indicating that the proposed system within the site is designed with adequate capacity to convey the sewage generated from the proposed site. The Applicant shall supplement these calculations with an analysis of the existing system located along Valley Road.

4.3 The existing sanitary sewer immediately downstream of proposed connection shall be televised to ensure that the sewer adequately conveys flow from the project and is in satisfactory working order with copies of the video inspection provided to the City and this office for review. Applicant shall provide and confirm pipe sizes for this existing sanitary sewer.

4.4 Sanitary sewer connections shall be coordinated with the City of Clifton Department of Public Works.

4.5 The Applicant is responsible for coordination of all new site utility service connections (water, gas, electric, telephone, internet) with utility authorities and is responsible for all associated costs for these utility services. All new utilities shall be located underground.

4.6 The applicant is responsible for coordinating water service connections with utility authority and confirming with the utility authority that adequate flow and pressure is available for the project. Fire hydrant flow test results shall be provided to this office for review. The sizes for the proposed domestic and fire water lines shall be included on the final plans.

4.7 We recommend a fire hydrant or hydrants or fire department connections (FDCs) be installed along the project frontage or on-site subject to review by the City fire chief, fire safety official, and fire department.

4.8 The Applicant shall coordinate the location of all proposed fire suppression measures with the City fire chief, fire safety official, and fire department. A final plan showing all proposed fire suppression measures on one plan sheet shall be provided to the above noted City fire officials with a copy to this office for review.

4.9 Testimony with respect to location of the gas and or electric meter banks shall be provided, and the design should locate the same to minimize visual impact.

- 4.10 The Applicant shall revise the utility plan to include the means of electric service for the proposed development, including all transformer locations.
- 4.11 The Applicant shall identify all stormwater and sanitary pipe crossings on the plan and provide calculations indicating a minimum vertical separation of eighteen (18) inches at each pipe crossing on the Site Plans. The crossing of the stormwater trench drain with the sanitary pipe at the site entrance shall also be analyzed.
- 4.12 The Applicant shall identify the locations of all water and gas utility valves in the Site Plans.
- 4.13 The Applicant shall include a sanitary sewer pipe trench construction detail in the Site Plans.

5. Grading and Drainage Comments

- 5.1 **The Applicant has provided a Stormwater Management Report for the proposed development with supporting drainage area maps. We offer the following comments with respect to the drainage calculations:**
 - a) **The Applicant shall include a drainage narrative associated with the drainage calculations that shall include a project overview, a determination classifying the project as a major development as defined by City Ordinance and NJDEP Stormwater Management Rules, the stormwater management methodology utilized in the design as it relates to the NJDEP BMP Manual requirements for green infrastructure, descriptions of existing and proposed drainage conditions, and a final conclusion summarizing the stormwater management results.**
 - b) **The Applicant shall provide existing and proposed peak flow rate calculations for the 25-year storm in addition to the 2-, 10-, and 100-year storm calculations provided.**
 - c) **The Applicant indicates that the total drainage area to the basin is 38,205 square feet, which is equivalent to the summation of the drainage areas collected into catch basins and discharging into the basin. However, the Applicant does not consider areas that sheet flow into the basin, as well as the footprint area of the basin itself. It appears that a portion of Proposed Drainage Area #9 will flow into the proposed basin based on the proposed grading, although the drainage map indicates flow will be directed towards Lot 11, which may cause adverse effects to the neighboring property. The Applicant shall revise drainage calculations accordingly and provide testimony with respect to the perimeter grading.**
 - d) **The “Storm Sewer System Analysis Summary” Table on page 6 of the drainage calculations includes velocities in the pipe capacity column, whereas this column should include the flow rates of the pipes and not the velocity, which are to be compared to the calculated cumulative flows. This discrepancy shall be revised accordingly.**
 - e) **The drainage calculations report shall include water quality, groundwater recharge, groundwater mounding, conduit outlet protection, and drainage swale calculations in accordance with NJDEP requirements for major developments.**
 - f) **The Applicant proposes permeable pavers on the plan but does not account for any stormwater storage in the drainage calculations related to these permeable pavers.**
- 5.2 **We offer the following comments with respect to the drainage area maps:**
 - a) **The Applicant’s hydrologic methodology of the existing site considers the subject property as a single drainage area ultimately discharging towards Valley Road. The Applicant shall provide point**

discharge analysis with supporting calculations that indicate the proposed grading improvements and stormwater management design will not result in stormwater discharge in excess of pre-development conditions to the adjacent properties on Lots 11, 13, and 14 and shall provide testimony with respect to the same. The proposed grading around the property lines may require adjustments and additional stormwater containment measures implemented to ensure that the majority of the stormwater is contained onsite and the proposed drainage swales are designed adequately to collect and convey stormwater in accordance with the flow arrows depicted on the plan.

- b) The Applicant shall revise the Existing Conditions Drainage Map to include a Time of Concentration flow path.
- c) The Applicant shall delineate onsite soil types as per USDA NRCS mapping and a copy of the soil mapping report shall be provided.
- d) Based on the proposed contours, Proposed Catch Basins #1, #5, and #6 do not appear to consistent with their respective drainage area limits. The Applicant shall revise these catchment areas and calculations or provide additional grading clarifications such as spot elevations, high points, low points, ridge lines, etc. to indicate how runoff will be directed as indicated on the proposed drainage area map.
- e) Proposed Drainage Areas #1, #2, and #4 delineate areas that contain proposed catch basins that are not associates with the respective drainage area. This discrepancy shall be revised.
- f) The areas outside of the drainage area delineation limits shall be considered uncollected stormwater bypass areas and shall be analyzed as such.
- g) Several of the proposed seepage pits on the Proposed Conditions Drainage Map are larger than those proposed on the Utility and Drainage Plan. In addition, it appears that there is a conflict between the retaining wall and the seepage pit proposed in the western portion of the site.
- h) It appears that drainage areas 7A and 7B are omitted from the stormwater management design of the site, although these areas will be disturbed during construction and stormwater will sheet flow towards the proposed development according to the proposed grading. The Applicant shall provide testimony with respect to the containment of runoff from these drainage areas.

5.3 The Applicant is responsible for any negative drainage impacts to adjacent properties due to on-site improvements. Should a negative impact be identified upon completion of the project, the impact shall be addressed immediately. A note on the plan shall be provided stating the same.

A note has been added to the plans. This comment has been addressed.

5.4 A percolation / permeability test shall be performed within the vicinity of the proposed infiltration system(s) to confirm that infiltration is viable for the site. For conformance with the New Jersey Stormwater Best Management Practices (BMP) Manual, the seasonal groundwater table shall also be confirmed at an elevation two (2) or more feet below the proposed bottom of the proposed infiltration system. A note on the plan shall be provided stating the same. Results shall be forwarded to NEA for review and approval prior to construction of the proposed infiltration system.

-
- 5.5 The Applicant shall indicate the location of impervious vehicle traveled area required to be treated for 80% Total Suspended Solids (TSS) removal in accordance with NJDEP requirements and provide water quality calculations that satisfy the requirements. The Applicant shall revise the plans to include further treatment measures if deemed necessary.
- 5.6 The drainage plan indicates that the majority of the site stormwater runoff is collected in Type 'B' Inlets and conveyed through 12-inch Reinforced Concrete Pipes to ultimately discharge into the proposed "Water Quality Basin" along the frontage of the property. However, this basin does not have an outlet control structure to contain the water quality storm or any means of overflow during high intensity rainfall events. In addition, the extents of the 317-foot contour shall be included to clearly delineate the basin bottom and volume calculations shall be provided in the Stormwater Management Report. If the Applicant chooses to connect to the City's existing stormwater conveyance system along Valley Road, the existing storm drain immediately downstream of proposed connection shall be televised to ensure that the sewer adequately conveys flow from the project and is in satisfactory working order with copies of the video inspection provided to the City and this office for review.
- 5.7 The Applicant shall identify the location of all roof drains. The Applicant shall ensure that all stormwater runoff generated by the building roof area is collected via roof drains and are connected to a storm conveyance system via underground piping to prevent icing during the winter months.
- The proposed roof drains have been identified on the plans. The comment has been addressed.**
- 5.8 The proposed permeable paver system shall be designed in accordance with NJ Stormwater Best Management Practices Chapter 9.6. In addition, the Applicant shall identify the locations of all underdrains.
- The Applicant has removed the proposal for permeable pavers.**
- 5.9 In accordance with City of Clifton Zoning Code §461-24.1F, the Applicant is responsible for obtaining approval from the Hudson-Essex-Passaic Soil Conservation District. A soil erosion and sediment control plan shall be provided.
- 5.10 The Applicant shall delineate and indicate the area of disturbance in square feet and acres.
- This comment has been addressed.**
- 5.11 The Applicant shall provide cut and fill calculations in accordance with the requirements set forth in the City of Clifton Zoning Code §461-24.1I(1). Any fill brought to the site shall be certified clean fill by applicable NJDEP regulations.
- 5.12 The Applicant shall provide a means of conduit outlet protection at the discharge points of the proposed "Water Quality Basin" in accordance with the New Jersey Standards of Soil Erosion and Sediment Control.
- 5.13 The proposed 5-foot wide by 6-inch deep drainage swales shall be designed in accordance with the New Jersey Standards of Soil Erosion and Sediment Control and calculations shall be provided in the Stormwater Management Report.
- 5.14 The Applicant shall revise the 348-foot contour and shall include the location of the 350-foot contour on the western end of the proposed development. The Applicant shall include labels for all contours.

This comment has been addressed.

5.15 Additional top and bottom wall elevations shall be provided.

This comment has been addressed.

5.16 The flow arrow symbol denoted in the Legend to identify drainage swales is used extensively throughout the Site Plans in areas where drainage swales may not be proposed. The Applicant shall revise the plans accordingly.

The Applicant has removed these flow arrows from the plans.

5.17 In accordance with the City of Clifton Zoning Code §461-24.1I(2), parking and walkways shall not exceed 6%. It should be noted that the slope of the proposed common roadway on the southwest end of the site has a slope of 6.5%, which should be revised to ensure the adjacent walkways do not exceed the 6% slope set forth in the City Ordinance. The Steep Slope District Bulk Requirements Table shall also be revised as the status is currently indicated as "Pending".

This comment has been addressed.

5.18 In accordance with the NJDEP requirements for Stormwater Maintenance Plans, the maintenance plan is required to be recorded upon the deed of record for each property and this shall be described on the plan along with the annual plan filing requirements. The Operation and Maintenance Plan for Stormwater Management Facilities shall include, but not be limited to:

- a) A List of Stormwater Management Measures with assigned BMP numbers, a location description for each BMP, and associated state plane coordinates
- b) A location map indicating the relevant locations of the proposed stormwater management measures
- c) A description of each of the proposed stormwater management measures that shall include the design purpose and the associated dimensions of each measure
- d) A Preventative and Corrective Maintenance Action Plan that shall include the frequency of each preventative and corrective maintenance action specific to each stormwater management measure
- e) A description of the required equipment, tools, and supplies necessary to perform the various preventative and corrective maintenance tasks specified on the plan
- f) A disposal plan that shall include the approved disposal and recycling sites for all types of material removed from the stormwater management measures during maintenance operations
- g) A cost estimate breakdown of each maintenance task cited in the maintenance plan
- h) A description of the safety measures and procedures, including all procedures, tools and equipment required to protect the safety of inspection and maintenance personnel
- i) A site-specific training plan to readily detect maintenance-related problems with associated training records
- j) Annual evaluation of the effectiveness of the maintenance plan comparing the maintenance plan with the actual performance of the maintenance

6. Landscape and Lighting Comments

- 6.1 The Applicant shall provide testimony regarding the operating hours of the proposed lighting, including, but not limited to, hours of full site lighting, hours of security lighting, etc.
- 6.2 The Applicant proposes ~~eight (8) LED pole-mounted light fixtures~~ **fourteen (14) pole-mounted 3,000K RAB LED lights along proposed common roadway, fourteen (14) surface-mounted LED lights, and forty-eight (48) Recessed Mount LED lights.** We offer the following comments on the lighting:

a) Any LED lighting shall be equipped with LED controls to allow the full adjustment and control of all light levels in order to make field adjustments to light levels as necessary.

- 6.3 In accordance with Clifton Zoning Code §461—1a, the light fixtures shall be high pressure sodium. The Applicant shall indicate the color temperature of the proposed lights at a maximum of 2,700 Kelvin to mimic high pressure sodium lights. A variance is required for the proposed pole-mounted lighting.

- 6.4 Pursuant to Section §461-13 of the City of Clifton Code, all parking areas shall be so lighted as to provide not less than one footcandle of illumination at all times in all parts of such areas. The Applicant proposes lighting intensities less than one footcandle of illumination in some parking areas. The Applicant shall revise the Lighting Plan to provide a minimum of one footcandle of illumination, or a variance shall be requested.

This comment has been addressed.

- 6.5 Lighting levels on-site shall comply with the standards established by the City Ordinance pursuant to §461-60B. The light levels shall be 0.0 footcandles at all property lines. The Applicant shall revise the plans accordingly and testimony addressing the same shall be provided or a variance/waiver is required.

- 6.6 In accordance with the City of Clifton Zoning Code §461—40K all proposed trees shall be a minimum 4-inch caliper, measured 4.5-feet above grade when planted. The planting schedule shall be revised to comply with this ordinance.

This comment has been addressed.

- 6.7 The Applicant shall revise the Tree Planting Detail to note that the excavated hole shall be two times the width of the plant's root ball.

This comment has been addressed.

- 6.8 The Applicant shall revise the Landscape & Lighting Plan to include landscape-specific notes that shall include, but not be limited to:

a) Any discrepancies between plans, notes, details and existing conditions shall be immediately reported to the landscape architect prior to resuming work. The contractor shall assume full responsibility for all revisions due to failure to give such notice.

b) Contractor shall field locate plant material for landscape architect approval prior to installation.

- c) Contractor is responsible for verifying plant quantities. If there is a discrepancy between the plant count shown in the plan list and the planting graphic, the graphic shall take precedence.
- d) Contractor shall not deviate from the approved plan and its contents without the prior written consent by the landscape architect.
- e) Stipulation of a guarantee period of two (2) years. Upon completion of the two-year plant guarantee period, the landscape contractor is responsible for removing planting saucers and all stakes from tree. This shall be done consultation with the landscape architect.
- f) All plant material shall have root balls that are not cracked, loose, or broken. Plant materials that are stored on the site for longer than three days shall be kept in the shade, protected from weather and mechanical injury and have the root balls healed in and kept watered well.
- g) All plant beds and lawn areas shall be serviced by an automatic irrigation system.
- h) All trees not serviced by automatic irrigation shall be provided with 20 gallon tree watering bags or diapers, and shall be filled/refilled and maintained by the landscape contractor for the duration of the guarantee period.
- i) All plant beds shall receive a minimum of eighteen (18) inches of topsoil (settled) and all lawn areas six (6) inches of topsoil (settled). All parking lot planting islands shall receive thirty-six (36) inches of topsoil.
- j) Trees on the site shall be regulated in terms of removal, replacement and protection in accordance with City Ordinance §433-30, as necessary.

This comment has been addressed.

7. Architectural Comments

- 7.1 The Architect shall provide testimony with respect to the proposed floor plans, unit sizes, and building heights.
- 7.2 The Architect shall provide testimony with respect to the proposed exterior of the building, including but not limited to materials, colors, textures, etc.
- 7.3 The Architect should provide testimony with respect to the location of proposed mechanicals, HVAC equipment, etc.

8. Final Comments

- 8.1 Should the Board look favorably upon this application, a performance bond and inspection escrow will be required for site improvements in accordance with the Municipal Land Use Law to be incorporated into the Developer's Agreement for the project. The Applicant's engineer shall provide an engineer's estimated cost for site improvements to this office for review.
- 8.2 The Applicant shall obtain any and all approvals required by outside agencies and internal municipal departments, including but not limited to the NJDOT, NJDEP, Passaic County, Hudson-Essex-Passaic Soil Conservation District, as well as the City of Clifton Police Department, Fire Department, Emergency

Management and Department of Public Works. The Applicant's responsibility is to determine what outside agency permits are required. Copies of said approvals shall be provided upon receipt.

- 8.3 New and revised materials shall be filed with the City and shall not be sent directly to the Board's professionals. The municipality will forward the application and related materials to the Board's professionals when finished with their review. Materials submitted directly to NEA will not be reviewed.
- 8.4 Revised reports, plans, and exhibits that are to be considered at the hearing should be submitted ten days prior to the scheduled hearing.
- 8.5 The above comments are based on a review of materials submitted and testimony provided to date. NEA reserves the right to provide new or updated comments as additional information becomes available.
- 8.6 NEA recommends that a comment response letter be prepared and submitted addressing the comments/recommendations of this letter.

We trust you will find the above in order. Should you require any additional information, please do not hesitate to contact the undersigned.

Very truly yours,
Neglia Engineering Associates



Anthony Kurus, P.E., P.P., C.M.E.
Principal

Very truly yours,
Neglia Engineering Associates



Brian Intindola, P.E., P.P., C.M.E., C.P.W.M.
Principal

- cc: Liana Bolcato – Housing & Zoning Department (via: email)
Ernie Tedesco – Construction Official (via: email)
Michael Lardner, P.E. – City Engineer (via: email)
Frank Prezioso – City Fire Chief (via email)
Michael Pressler – Fire Official (via email)
Lisa Medina – Station Manager (via: email)
John D. Pogorelec, Esq. – Board Attorney (via: email)
Nicholas Graviano, P.P. – Board Planner (via: email)
Jason R. Tuvel, Esq. – Applicant's Attorney (via: email jason@primelaw.com)
Steven L. Koestner, P.E. – Applicant's Engineer (via: email info@koestnerassociates.com)
File – AK/YMS

\\Nea-file01\WDOX\$\MUNI\CLIF\CLIFSPL22021\CORRESP\00345239.DOCX